

**Minutes**  
**West Lafayette Historic Preservation Commission**  
**Certificate of Appropriateness Sub-Committee**  
**Morton Community Center**  
**222 N. Chauncey Avenue**  
**West Lafayette, IN 47906**  
**September 13<sup>th</sup>, 2016**

The meeting was called to order at 6:01 p.m. by Peter Bunder, Chair, who presided.

Present: Peter Bunder, Arnold Sweet, Kurt Wahl, Erik Carlson,

Absent: Colby Bertlett

**545 Hayes Street**

The contractor for this project approached the sub-committee. Kurt Wahl spoke about the property. Wahl stated that he trusts the applicant on the deteriorating condition of the garage on the property. He continued to speak about a potential roof line design. The contractor passed out a simple drawing about the planned garage design, indicating that their intentions are to keep the same style of the current garage, but restore the deteriorating structure. Wahl stated that he is in agreement with the proposed garage style, but asked if the contractor has considered a gable roof, instead of a hip roof. The contractor stated no. Wahl pointed out the nearby garages and structures have gable roofs, so this garage may better blend with the adjacent structures if a gable roof was used, instead of a hip roof. He also stated that perhaps the gable roof could be turned to face Stadium Avenue with a dormer, as a reflection off the current home on the property. The contractor stated that there are height restrictions for this project due to overhead powerlines which may prevent the use of a gable roof. Wahl stated that the proposed roof would be fine. The contractor spoke about other materials that will be used in building the garage, such as a metal roof and vinyl siding.

Erik Carlson asked where the location of the adjacent garage in respect to the current garage on 545 Hayes Street. Wahl stated it would be on Hayes Street, to the South of 545 Hayes Street. Wahl continued to review the materials that will be used on this project. Wahl recommended that the COA for 545 Hayes Street be approved. Wahl questioned what certain objects were out in the yard at this property. The Contractor answered by explaining a collaborative project with Purdue University's School of Engineering and Whirlpool.

Bunder moved to approve the COA for 545 Hayes Street, noting that there was not enough room for a gable roof. Arnold Sweet seconded.

Vote: Yes-Bunder, Sweet  
No-

Sub-committee approves COA for 545 Hayes Street.

### **Public Comment**

Tom Fields from 3647 Litchfield Lane, West Lafayette. Fields stated that he owns properties on Stadium Avenue and Sylvia Street. He explained that vinyl siding was approved for the garage at 545 Hayes Street and he is not sure if vinyl is allowed with the Ordinance for future projects. Carlson spoke about Phase II of the Ordinance does not go into effect until September 30<sup>th</sup>. He also stated that the Ordinance itself does not forbid the use of vinyl outright. Wahl spoke about 545 Hayes structure being a non-contributing structure with no historic fabric on the structure itself. Wahl continued by explaining that the outcome might have been difference if the garage at 545 Hayes was a contributing structure or had historic fabric for which vinyl would cover or replace. Carlson asked for Wahl to expand on examples of when vinyl could cover wood siding. Wahl stated that historic fabric that is removed and send to the dump cannot be retrieved. He continued by stating a scenario where a project would save a section of siding that can be saved, but the majority of the structure would need new siding. To bring the whole building into the same style and design, the section of historic fabric that has been saved can be covered so the whole structure matches. Wahl also mentioned that there are many variables and if the historical fabric is in a deteriorating state, they cannot be saved and restored. Commissioner Bunder spoke about past materials that were approved and do not require a particular material.

Bunder moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Sweet seconded. The sub-committee adjourned at 6:23 p.m.

---

Peter Bunder, Chair